



Willoughby City Council

ORDINARY COUNCIL

MINUTES

Council Chamber, Level 6, 31 Victor Street, Chatswood

11 March 2019

commencing at 7:00pm

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
1 PRESENT	4
2 DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST	4
3 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES	4
4 APOLOGIES AND LEAVE OF ABSENCE	4
5 PETITIONS	6
6 OPEN FORUM	6
7 MAYORAL MINUTE	7
7.1 MAYORAL MINUTE - RECORDING OF CONFIDENTIAL COUNCIL MEETING SESSIONS	7
7.1 MAYOR'S DIARY: COUNCIL MEETING NOTES – 11 MARCH 2019.....	9
8 GENERAL MANAGER'S LATE REPORT	11
9 MATTERS FOR DEFERRAL OR PROCEDURAL PRIORITY	11
10 MATTERS NOT REQUIRING ELABORATION OR DEBATE	11
11 MATTERS BROUGHT FORWARD BY THE PUBLIC	11
12 REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES	12
12.1 MINUTES - BICYCLE CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE HELD ON 12 FEBRUARY 2019	12
12.2 MINUTES - LOCAL TRAFFIC COMMITTEE HELD ON 20 FEBRUARY 2019	13
13 DEFERRED MATTERS	14
14 CORRESPONDENCE	14
15 REPORTS FROM OFFICERS - GENERAL MANAGER	14
16 REPORTS FROM OFFICERS – CUSTOMER AND CORPORATE SUPPORT DIRECTORATE	15
16.1 EXHIBITION DRAFT CODE OF CONDUCT.....	15
17 REPORTS FROM OFFICERS – COMMUNITY, CULTURE AND LEISURE DIRECTORATE	17
17.1 COUNCIL CAB SERVICE.....	17
18 REPORTS FROM OFFICERS – PLANNING AND INFRASTRUCTURE DIRECTORATE	19
18.1 67 ALBERT AVENUE, CHATSWOOD - OWNER'S CONSENT	19
18.2 TENDER 113625 - ARTARMON ROAD BRIDGE REPAIRS	20
18.3 TENDER 120485 - CHATSWOOD SKATE PARK UPGRADE.....	21
19 NOTICE OF MOTION	22
20 CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS	23
20.1 CONFIDENTIAL - TENDER 113625 - ARTARMON ROAD BRIDGE REPAIRS.....	23
20.2 CONFIDENTIAL - TENDER 120485 - CHATSWOOD SKATE PARK UPGRADE.....	23

21	QUESTIONS	26
21.1	QUESTIONS ON NOTICE FROM COUNCILLOR SAVILLE - QUARTERLY BUDGET REVIEW 2018/19	26

1 PRESENT

Her Worship the Mayor Councillor G Giles-Gidney, Councillors C Campbell, H Eriksson, D Fernandez, W Norton, J Rutherford, A Rozos, L Saville, C Tuon, B Zhu and N Wright

Officers

Ms D Just (General Manager), Ms M Smith (Community, Culture & Leisure Director), Mr G McDonald (Planning & Infrastructure Director), Mr V Grepl (Acting Governance, Risk and Corporate Planning Manager) and Ms P Sheldrake (Minutes Secretary)

2 DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

NIL

Recommittal Motion

That Council recommit disclosures to allow Councillor Wright to disclose a pecuniary interest in Item 18.1: 67 Albert Avenue, Chatswood – Owner’s Consent as he is an employee of Westpac Banking Corporation. Councillor Wright withdrew from Chambers taking no part in the discussion or voting on this topic.

3 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

RESOLUTION

That the Minutes of the Ordinary Meeting of Council held 25 February 2019, copies of which have been circulated to each member of Council, be confirmed.

MOVED COUNCILLOR RUTHERFORD

SECONDED COUNCILLOR SAVILLE

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

4 APOLOGIES AND LEAVE OF ABSENCE

- Councillor Coppock is on leave previously granted.
- Councillor Mustaca requested Leave of Absence for Monday 11 March 2019.
- Councillor Wright requested Leave of Absence for Monday 15 April 2019.

RESOLUTION

That Council:

1. Note Council Coppock is on leave previously granted.
2. Grant Leave of Absence to Councillor Mustaca for Monday 11 March 2019.
3. Grant Leave of Absence to Councillor Wright for Monday 15 April 2019.

MOVED COUNCILLOR FERNANDEZ

SECONDED COUNCILLOR ZHU

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

5 PETITIONS

NIL

6 OPEN FORUM

NIL

7 MAYORAL MINUTE

7.1 MAYORAL MINUTE - RECORDING OF CONFIDENTIAL COUNCIL MEETING SESSIONS

MEETING DATE: 11 MARCH 2019

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To implement recording of the confidential sessions of Council meetings for the purpose of assisting with compilation of minutes.

DISCUSSION

Following the implementation of webcasting, the recording of public sessions of Council meetings is now done via webcasts. These serve a wider purpose beyond assisting with compilation of minutes as they enable increased access and transparency.

The recording of confidential sessions is also advisable as these at times cover contentious material and it is encouraged as best practice by the Office of Local Government. There is nothing in legislation, or Council's current Code of Meeting Practice, which prevents recording. This proposal complies with the *Privacy and Personal Information Protection Act 1998* as recording is reasonably necessary for a lawful purpose that is directly related to council's function. Among Sydney metro Councils, at least 11 record the confidential sessions.

Council endorsed on 11 February 2019 a new draft Code of Meeting Practice for public exhibition with a clause that provides for recording confidential sessions:

17.3 In addition to webcasting council meetings, confidential sessions of council meetings will be audio recorded, only for the purposes of compiling council minutes.

A procedure will be developed for access to recordings by Council officials. It will be guided by the following key points:

- The primary purpose of recording is to ensure the accuracy of meeting minutes.
- Access will be guided by Code of Conduct requirements on provision of information needed for carrying out civic duties.
- A request for the recording must specify the purpose in accessing the recording and the portion of the confidential session.
- If granted, access will be by listening to the recording at Council's Victor Street offices; that is, copies of the recording will not be made and distributed.
- The period of retention of sound recording is two years to be consistent with the retention of webcasts.

MOTION

That Council record the confidential sessions of Council meetings from 25 March 2019 for the purpose of assisting with compilation of minutes and retain the recordings so made for a period of two years.

MOVED COUNCILLOR GILES-GIDNEY

CARRIED

It was noted that Councillor Norton voted against the Motion.

7.1 MAYOR'S DIARY: COUNCIL MEETING NOTES – 11 MARCH 2019

MONDAY 25 FEBRUARY			
Mayor	1.15 pm	Seniors Month Event - "Beating Time"	Dougherty Centre
TUESDAY 26 FEBRUARY			
Mayor Deputy Mayor: Cr Rutherford Crs Norton, Rozos	9.30 am	Unveiling of Commemorative Plaque for Rose Hazelwood	WPPS School Crossing
Cr Saville	9.30 am	NSLHD - Mental health in residential facilities	Northside Conference Centre
Crs Norton, Saville	5 pm	Heritage Advisory Committee	Lomandra Room
Cr Norton	7.30 pm	Castle Cove Progress Association	Castle Cove Community Centre
WEDNESDAY 27 FEBRUARY			
Cr Norton	10.30 am	Seniors Month Event – Harbour Cruise	Sydney
Mayor Cr Campbell	11.30 am	Citizenship Ceremony	Council Chambers
Mayor	evening	Citizenship Ceremony	North Sydney Council
THURSDAY 28 FEBRUARY			
Mayor	10 am	Meeting with Mercy College Students	Council Chambers
Deputy Mayor: Cr Rutherford Representing the Mayor	10 am	NS Police Area Command Awards	Roseville Golf Club
Cr Saville	6 pm	Sustainability Reference Committee	WCC
Crs Eriksson, Norton, Zhu, Fernandez	6.30 pm	Draft Housing & Local Centres Strategies Roundtable: Northbridge	Council Chambers
SATURDAY 2 MARCH			
Cr Norton	10.30 am	Local Centres Strategies Drop in: East Chatswood/High Street	Willoughby Uniting Church
Mayor	1.30 pm	Australian International Children's Art Competition – Presentation of Awards	Chinese Cultural Centre
SUNDAY 3 MARCH			
Cr Norton	2.30 pm	WSOC Chamber Series Concert	Zenith Theatre
MONDAY 4 MARCH			
TUESDAY 5 MARCH			
Deputy Mayor: Cr Rutherford Cr Norton	9 am	Cultural Events Committee	Banksia Room
Crs Eriksson, Norton	7 pm	FPA - "Meet The Candidates"	Dougherty Centre
WEDNESDAY 6 MARCH			
Mayor Cr Saville	9.30 am	LGNSW Save Our Recycling Summit	The Royal Sydney Mint
THURSDAY 7 MARCH			
Cr Norton	5.30 pm	Bike Stakeholders Meeting	Banksia Room
Mayor Crs Tuon, Zhu	6.30 pm	"Pink Elite" International Women's Day Celebration	Zenith Theatre
Cr Norton	6.30 pm	Draft Housing & Local Centres Strategies Roundtable: East Chatswood/High Street	Council Chambers

FRIDAY 8 MARCH			
Mayor Cr Saville, Tuon	8.45 am	International Women's Day Event	The Civic Pavilion
Mayor Cr Saville	10 am	Local Government Debate	Parliament House
Mayor	12.30 pm	LGNSW International Women's Day Event	The Tea Room, QVB Sydney
Cr Saville	5 pm	SCCG Executive Meeting	WCC
SATURDAY 9 MARCH			
Mayor	1.30 pm	Opening of Expo: Saturated Terrain	/the Incinerator Art Space
Mayor Crs Eriksson, Campbell, Norton, Rozos, Tuon, Zhu	2.30 pm	Pre-Opening Celebration: Gore Hill Park	Gore Hill Park
SUNDAY 10 MARCH			
Mayor	12.30 pm	Children of Armenia – Charity Event	Jones Bay Wharf

8 GENERAL MANAGER'S LATE REPORT

NIL

9 MATTERS FOR DEFERRAL OR PROCEDURAL PRIORITY

NIL

10 MATTERS NOT REQUIRING ELABORATION OR DEBATE

The Mayor invited Councillors to indicate the items not brought forward by the public that they wished to deal with separately:

- Item 12.2 Minutes – Local Traffic Committee held on 20 February 2019
- Item 16.1 Exhibition Draft Code of Conduct
- Item 17.1 Council Cab Service
- Item 18.1 67 Albert Avenue, Chatswood – Owner's consent

RESOLUTION

That the remaining items, viz:

- Item 12.1 Minutes – Bicycle Consultative Committee held on 12 February 2019
- Item 18.2 Tender 113625 – Artarmon Road bridge repairs
- Item 18.3 Tender 120485 – Chatswood Skate Park upgrade

be adopted in accordance with the recommendations in the reports.

MOVED COUNCILLOR ERIKSSON

SECONDED COUNCILLOR ZHU

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

Absent: Councillor Norton.

11 MATTERS BROUGHT FORWARD BY THE PUBLIC

NIL

12 REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES

12.1 MINUTES - BICYCLE CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE HELD ON 12 FEBRUARY 2019

ATTACHMENTS:	1. IMPLICATIONS 2. MINUTES
RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	GREG MCDONALD - PLANNING & INFRASTRUCTURE DIRECTOR
AUTHOR:	GORDON FARRELLY –TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORT TEAM LEADER
CITY STRATEGY OUTCOME:	2.1 – ENHANCE TRANSPORT CHOICES AND CONNECTIONS THROUGHOUT THE CITY
MEETING DATE:	11 MARCH 2019

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To advise Council of the outcome of the Bicycle Consultative Committee Meeting held on 12 February 2019.

RESOLUTION

That Council receive and note the recommendations arising from the 12 February 2019 Bicycle Consultative Committee Meeting.

MOVED COUNCILLOR ERIKSSON

SECONDED COUNCILLOR ZHU

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

Absent: Councillor Norton.

12.2 MINUTES - LOCAL TRAFFIC COMMITTEE HELD ON 20 FEBRUARY 2019

ATTACHMENTS:	1. IMPLICATIONS 2. TRAFFIC COMMITTEE MINUTES OF 20 FEBRUARY 2019 (CIRCULATED SEPARATELY)
RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	GREG MCDONALD - PLANNING & INFRASTRUCTURE DIRECTOR
AUTHOR:	GORDON FARRELLY – SENIOR TRAFFIC ENGINEER
CITY STRATEGY OUTCOME:	2.1 – ENHANCE TRANSPORT CHOICES AND CONNECTIONS THROUGHOUT THE CITY 2.4 – REDUCE PARKING AND TRAFFIC CONGESTION 3.1 – FOSTER FEELINGS OF SAFETY, SECURITY AND CLEANLINESS
MEETING DATE:	11 MARCH 2019

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To advise Council of the outcome of the latest Traffic Committee Meeting held on 20 February 2019.

RESOLUTION

That Council receive and adopt the recommendations arising from the 20 February 2019 Traffic Committee meeting.

MOVED COUNCILLOR SAVILLE

SECONDED COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

13 DEFERRED MATTERS

NIL

14 CORRESPONDENCE

NIL

15 REPORTS FROM OFFICERS - GENERAL MANAGER

NIL

16 REPORTS FROM OFFICERS – CUSTOMER AND CORPORATE SUPPORT DIRECTORATE

16.1 EXHIBITION DRAFT CODE OF CONDUCT

ATTACHMENTS:	1. IMPLICATIONS 2. DRAFT CODE OF CONDUCT 3. SUMMARY - DRAFT CODE OF CONDUCT
RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	DEAN FROST – CUSTOMER & CORPORATE DIRECTOR
AUTHOR:	EVANGELINA MARTINEZ – POLICY & SUBMISSIONS SPECIALIST
CITY STRATEGY OUTCOME:	5.1 – BE HONEST, TRANSPARENT AND ACCOUNTABLE IN ALL THAT WE DO
MEETING DATE:	11 MARCH 2019

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To endorse for public exhibition Council's draft Code of Conduct.

MOTION

That Council:

1. Place on public exhibition the draft Code of Conduct (Attachment 2) for a period of 28 days and invite public comment.
2. Receive a further report at the conclusion of the exhibition period that considers any submissions prior to it adopting the policy.
3. Include an additional point in the description of bullying behaviours in clause 3.10 of the draft Code of Conduct:
 - i) Excluding or isolating employees.

MOVED COUNCILLOR NORTON

SECONDED COUNCILLOR SAVILLE

NOT PUT

AMENDMENT

That Council:

1. Place on public exhibition the draft Code of Conduct (Attachment 2) for a period of 28 days and invite public comment.
2. Receive a further report at the conclusion of the exhibition period that considers any submissions prior to it adopting the policy.

MOVED COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

SECONDED COUNCILLOR ERIKSSON

CARRIED

Voting

For the Amendment: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Rozos, Rutherford, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Councillors Norton, Saville and Tuon.

The Amendment on being put to the meeting was carried to become the resolution of Council.

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Councillor Saville.

It was agreed that, for clarification purposes, in Item 3.32 under *Fraud and corruption prevention* the words "Council's administration" replace the word "Council" in the first sentence.

17 REPORTS FROM OFFICERS – COMMUNITY, CULTURE AND LEISURE DIRECTORATE

17.1 COUNCIL CAB SERVICE

ATTACHMENTS:	1. IMPLICATIONS 2. COMMUNITY TRANSPORT SUMMARY 3. COUNCIL CAB DATA 4. COUNCIL AGED SERVICES FEES AND SUBSIDY
RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	MELANIE SMITH – COMMUNITY, CULTURE & LEISURE DIRECTOR
AUTHOR:	MICHAEL CASHIN – COMMUNITY LIFE MANAGER
CITY STRATEGY LINK:	2.7 PROMOTE ACCESSIBLE SERVICES FOR THE COMMUNITY
MEETING DATE:	11 MARCH 2019

PURPOSE OF REPORT

For Council to consider options to resolve equity and duplication issues associated with the current Council Cab service.

MOTION

That Council;

1. Endorse the transition of Council Cab users to alternate transport providers, including Council's *At Home with Willoughby* services, and the introduction of additional conditions of use from 31 March 2019 to increase equity as per Option 1 in this report namely;
 - i) Cap the maximum number of individual trips to four trips per client per week.
 - ii) Cap the maximum individual client subsidy to \$2,200 per client per annum.
 - iii) Limited eligibility for Council Cab to persons aged 65 years or older.
 - iv) Provide priority of access for medical appointments.
 - v) Exclude Council Cab service to and from registered clubs or other venues with alternate in-kind accessible transport.
 - vi) Clients must be eligible and registered for Commonwealth Home Support Program funding to receive a subsidised fee.
 - vii) Subsidised fee is \$6.50 per trip.
 - viii) Full fee for non-eligible users is \$17.75 per trip.
 - ix) Clients will receive a single monthly invoice for Council Cab services, integrated with billing of other *At Home with Willoughby* services.
2. Endorse the cessation of Council Cab services at 30 June 2019.

3. Endorse the replacement of the Council Cab services from 1 July 2019 by a new service with the conditions of use stated in recommendation 1 above, the name of the service to be advised by 30 June 2019.

MOVED COUNCILLOR NORTON

SECONDED COUNCILLOR SAVILLE

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

18 REPORTS FROM OFFICERS – PLANNING AND INFRASTRUCTURE DIRECTORATE

18.1 67 ALBERT AVENUE, CHATSWOOD - OWNER'S CONSENT

ATTACHMENTS:	1. IMPLICATIONS
RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	GREG MCDONALD – PLANNING & INFRASTRUCTURE DIRECTOR
AUTHOR:	ANNA VECCHIO – PROPERTY LEASING OFFICER
CITY STRATEGY OUTCOME:	4.1 FACILITATE THE DEVELOPMENT OF ALL BUSINESSES
MEETING DATE:	11 MARCH 2019

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To seek Council's approval to provide owner's consent for the application received from CorVal on behalf of their tenant, Westpac Banking Corporation, for the internal refurbishment of Suite 5, Level 5, 67 Albert Avenue, Chatswood.

RESOLUTION

That Council authorise the General Manager to execute the application for a Complying Development Certificate, providing owner's consent for Westpac Banking Corporation's internal refurbishment of Suite 5, Level 5, 67 Albert Avenue, Chatswood.

MOVED COUNCILLOR SAVILLE

SECONDED COUNCILLOR ERIKSSON

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, and Zhu.

Against: Nil

Absent: Councillor Wright.

Due to Councillor Wright declaring a pecuniary interest in Item 18.1: 67 Albert Avenue, Chatswood – Owner's Consent due to being an employee of Westpac Banking Corporation he withdrew from the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting on this topic.

18.2 TENDER 113625 - ARTARMON ROAD BRIDGE REPAIRS

ATTACHMENTS:	1. IMPLICATIONS
RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	GREG MCDONALD – PLANNING & INFRASTRUCTURE DIRECTOR
AUTHOR:	PAUL GOMEZ – INFRASTRUCTURE & PARKING MANAGEMENT TEAM LEADER
CITY STRATEGY OUTCOME:	5.3 – BALANCE THE CREATION OF NEW PUBLIC ASSETS WITH THE UPGRADE OF EXISTING PUBLIC ASSETS
MEETING DATE:	11 MARCH 2019

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To award Tender 113625 for Artarmon Road Bridge Repairs.

RESOLUTION

That Council:

- 1. Accept the tender from the highest ranked tenderer for tender 113625 Artarmon Road Bridge Repairs for \$625,200 excluding GST.**
- 2. Authorise the General Manager to execute the contract documents and all associated documents.**

MOVED COUNCILLOR ERIKSSON

SECONDED COUNCILLOR ZHU

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

Absent: Councillor Norton.

18.3 TENDER 120485 - CHATSWOOD SKATE PARK UPGRADE

ATTACHMENTS:	1. IMPLICATIONS
RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	MELANIE SMITH – COMMUNITY, CULTURE & LEISURE DIRECTOR
AUTHOR:	AMY BARNES – OPEN SPACE PROJECTS OFFICER
CITY STRATEGY OUTCOME:	5.3 – BALANCE THE CREATION OF NEW PUBLIC ASSETS WITH THE UPGRADE OF EXISTING PUBLIC ASSETS
MEETING DATE:	11 MARCH 2019

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To award Tender 120485 for upgrade works to Chatswood Skate Park.

RESOLUTION

That Council:

- 1. Accept the tender from the highest ranked tenderer for Tender 120485 for Chatswood Skate Park Upgrade with a total contract value of \$190,000 excluding GST.**
- 2. Authorise the General Manager to execute the contract and all associated documents.**

MOVED COUNCILLOR ERIKSSON

SECONDED COUNCILLOR ZHU

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

Absent: Councillor Norton.

19 NOTICE OF MOTION

NIL

20 CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS

In accordance with the *Local Government Act 1993*, and the *Local Government (General) Regulation 2005*, in the option of the General Manager, the following business is confidential as referred to in Section 10A(2) of the Act, and should be dealt with in a Confidential Session of the Council meeting closed to the press and public.

Procedural Motion

That:

1. Council resolve itself into Closed Session with the Press and Public excluded from the meeting to deal with the following confidential items.
2. Council resolve into Committee of the Whole in order to deal with these confidential items.

Council moved into closed session at 8:04pm.

20.1 CONFIDENTIAL - TENDER 113625 - ARTARMON ROAD BRIDGE REPAIRS

Reason for Confidentiality

This report is **CONFIDENTIAL** in accordance with Section 10A(2)(d) of the *Local Government Act 1993*, which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following: -

- (d) commercial information of a confidential nature that would if disclosed:
 - (i) prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied it

20.2 CONFIDENTIAL - TENDER 120485 - CHATSWOOD SKATE PARK UPGRADE

Reason for Confidentiality

This report is **CONFIDENTIAL** in accordance with Section 10A(2)(d) of the *Local Government Act 1993*, which permits the meeting to be closed to the public for business relating to the following: -

- (d) commercial information of a confidential nature that would if disclosed:
 - (i) prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied it.

20.1 CONFIDENTIAL - TENDER 113625 - ARTARMON ROAD BRIDGE REPAIRS

Recommendation Summary

That Council:

1. **Accept the alternative tender 113625 from Silver Raven Pty Ltd for Artarmon Road Bridge Repairs for a contract value of \$625,200 excluding GST.**

2. Allocate sufficient funds in the next budget review to meet the contract value of \$625,200 excluding GST.
3. Make public resolutions 1 and 2 following the Council's resolution to accept the tender.

MOVED COUNCILLOR ROZOS

SECONDED COUNCILLOR FERNANDEZ

CARRIED

Voting

For the Recommendation: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

20.2 CONFIDENTIAL - TENDER 120485 - CHATSWOOD SKATE PARK UPGRADE

Recommendation Summary

That Council:

1. Accept the tender for Tender 120485 from Concrete Skate Parks for Chatswood Skate Park Upgrade for a lump sum contract value of \$190,000 excluding GST.
2. Make public resolution 1 following Council's resolution to accept the tender.

MOVED COUNCILLOR SAVILLE

SECONDED COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL

CARRIED

Voting

For the Recommendation: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

RESOLUTION

That the meeting revert to Open Council.

MOVED COUNCILLOR WRIGHT

SECONDED COUNCILLOR SAVILLE

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

Council moved into open session at 8:09pm.

RESOLUTION

That the recommendations of the Committee of the Whole be adopted.

MOVED COUNCILLOR SAVILLE

SECONDED COUNCILLOR ERIKSSON

CARRIED

Voting

For the Resolution: Councillors Giles-Gidney, Campbell, Eriksson, Fernandez, Norton, Rozos, Rutherford, Saville, Tuon, Wright and Zhu.

Against: Nil

21 QUESTIONS

21.1 QUESTIONS ON NOTICE FROM COUNCILLOR SAVILLE - QUARTERLY BUDGET REVIEW 2018/19

RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	DEAN FROST – DIRECTOR, CUSTOMER & CORPORATE
AUTHOR:	STEPHEN NAVEN – CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER
CITY STRATEGY OUTCOME:	5.1 – BE HONEST, TRANSPARENT AND ACCOUNTABLE IN ALL THAT WE DO
MEETING DATE:	11 MARCH 2019

QUESTION

1. With regards to the budget (Item 16.2, Agenda 25th February) to what extent is there relationship between the forecasted \$4.7m decrease in Infrastructure spending and \$319k in staff vacancies? Please comment.
2. It would appear that there is a decrease in level of service and extent of infrastructure due to decrease in staff numbers. Is this correct?

ANSWER

1. There is no correlation or relationship between these adjustments.

Councillors were briefed in detail on 18 February 2019 on the specific programs included within the \$4.7m reduction in Capital spend which was due to a combination of savings and changes in the delivery timeframe for projects. Both the savings and changes in project timelines are unrelated to staffing.

The report presented to, and adopted by Council at its last meeting held on 25 February 2019, stated:

"Capital expenditure is forecast to be \$4.7M lower due to a combination of savings (31 Victor Street façade; street lighting) and re-phasing of projects (Corporate System Review; Concourse shade structure; streetscapes) into the next financial year."
(Page 56).

The Council report also provided further information on page 66 and Attachment 4 of that report. In addition, Item 16.1 of the 25 February Council meeting presented the six monthly progress report for July to December 2018 and highlighted the following explanations for savings and re-phasing .

- Savings on the 31 Victor Street façade resulted in a \$730K saving.
- The Corporate systems review project is still in the tender evaluation phase (\$700K).
- The Concourse shade sails are delayed due to the need to undertake other works at The Concourse first (\$800K).
- The Artarmon streetscapes project was retimed as the community feedback to date sought changes that do not form part of the streetscape budget and program

of works and added further complexities in planning which will require engagement and coordination with other agencies (\$1.62M).

- The Street-light improvement program has a dependency on Ausgrid and Ausgrid has to date not been available to facilitate delivery (\$910K).

In addition, \$395K worth of Gross Pollutant Trap renewal programs were accelerated into this financial year.

2. No.

High customer satisfaction ratings, an increase in staff since 2017/18 and declining vacancy rates do not support the assumption of declining services and staff levels.

During 2018 Council undertook a Community perception Survey. Results of this survey highlighted an overall performance satisfaction index score of 72. This compared favourably with available comparisons (Sydney Metropolitan Councils satisfaction index 61 and Victorian Councils satisfaction index 64). This indicates a high level of satisfaction with Council's performance.

Since the 2017/18 financial year Council's staffing establishment full time equivalent (FTE) from 406 FTE to 410 FTE. These positions have been allocated to facilitate more roadside vegetation trimming (two positions), improved urban design (one position) and other minor staffing adjustments.

Since the adoption of the budget, staffing turnover (staff departures as a percentage of establishment staffing) has fallen from 9.21% as at December 2017 to 7.88% as at December 2018. This does not support the assertion of a decrease in staff numbers.

The reduction in expenditure in staff costs is a combined result of the fact that Council budgets for full employment of its 410 FTE as well as the time taken to recruit new staff following a departure from the organisation. In some cases, short term labour hire/agency staff or contractors are engaged to maintain service levels during these periods.

Infrastructure spend and the number of infrastructure projects has increased, rather than decreased over recent years.

- **Councillor Wright left the meeting at 8:03pm during debate on Item 18.1: 67 Albert Avenue, Chatswood – Owner's Consent taking no part in the discussion or vote on this topic and returned to the meeting after the vote.**

The meeting concluded at 8:13pm

I have authorised a stamp bearing my signature to be affixed to the pages of the Minutes of the Ordinary Council Meeting held on 11 March 2019. I confirm that Council has adopted these Minutes as a true and accurate record of the meeting.